EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

DOCKET NO.: 2006-1443-AIR-E TCEQ ID: RN104943642 CASE NO.: 30530

RESPONDENT NAME: GARY GENE CRUPPER

ORDER TYPE:						
X 1660 AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING				
FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	_SHUTDOWN ORDER	IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER				
AMENDED ORDER	_EMERGENCY ORDER					
CASE TYPE:						
_X_AIR	MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE				
PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION				
WATER QUALITY	SEWAGE SLUDGE	UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL				
MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	RADIOACTIVE WASTE	DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION				
SMALL BUSINESS: X Yes No OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There has been one complaint filed complaining that the Respondent was hauling material from his business and burning it. INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter. A complaint has been received, but the complainant has not indicated that he wishes to protest this action or speak at agenda. COMMENTS RECEIVED: The Texas Register comment period expired on April 21, 2008. No comments were received. CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney: Ms. Laurencia Fasoyiro, Litigation Division, MC 175, (713) 422-8914 Ms. Jennifer Cook, Litigation Division, MC 175, (512) 239-1873 TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Bryan Elliott, Air Enforcement Section, MC 149, (512) 239-6162 TCEQ Regional Contact: Ms. Alyssa Taylor, DFW Regional Office, MC R-4, (817) 588-5828 Respondent: Mr. Gary Gene Crupper, 4505 Cattleguard Court, Tolar, Texas 76476-5316 Respondent's Attorney: Mr. Robert Doshier, Doshier & Associates, 101 W. Pearl Street, Granbury, Texas 76048						
		•				

RESPONDENT NAME: GARY GENE CRUPPER

DOCKET NO.: 2006-1443-AIR-E

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART: VIOLATION INFORMATION PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED Type of Investigation: Total Assessed: \$1,050 **Ordering Provisions** X Complaint Total Deferred: \$0 The Respondent shall: Routine ___ Enforcement Follow-up Total Paid/Due to General Revenue: 1. Immediately, cease all unauthorized Records Review \$93/\$957 outdoor burnings at the Site. 2. Submit written certification of Date of Complaints Relating to this Case: The Respondent has paid \$93 of the administrative penalty. The remaining April 13, 2006 compliance. amount of \$957 of the administrative penalty shall be payable in 11 monthly payment of Dates of Investigation Relating to this \$87 each. Case: June 14, 2006 Site Compliance History Classification High X Average Poor Date of NOE Relating to this Case: July 14, 2006 Person Compliance History Classification **Background Facts:** The EDPRP was filed on July 25, 2007. The High X Average Poor Respondent filed an answer to the EDPRP on August 28, 2007. The Agreed Order was Major Source: Yes X No to the Respondent February 5, 2008. The Respondent signed Applicable Penalty Policy: September 1, the Agreed Order on February 7, 2008. 2002 The Respondent in this case does not owe any other penalties according to the Administrative Penalty Database Report. AIR Failed to comply with the prohibition of outdoor burning [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 111.201 and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.085(b)].

Pa	ge 1 of 4 06/11	1/08 C:\WIN	IDOWS\TEM	⊃\XPgrpwise\C	rupperRsdcPC\	W(revised).qpw	
Policy Revision 2		nalty Cal	culation	Workshe	et (PCW)	PCW Revision	May 19, 2005
TCEQ DATES Assigned PCW	17-Jul-2006 17-Nov-2006	Screening	27-Jul-2006	EPA Due			Carlos de Carlos (Asserta Albanda Carlos (Asserta (Assert
	Gary Gene Crup			to develop			
Reg. Ent. Ref. No. Facility/Site Region		orth		< Major	Minor Source	Minor Source	<u> </u>
CASE INFORMATION Enf./Case ID No. Docket No. Media Program(s) Multi-Media Admin. Penalty \$ L	30530 2006-1443-AIR- Air Quality	E \$0]	Maximum	≷ En			
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Penall	ty Calcul	ation Sec	tion		
TOTAL BASE PEN	NALTY (Sum o	of violation	base pena	ılties)		Subtotal 1	\$1,000
Compliance In Notes Culpability Notes Good Faith E Extraordinary Ordinary N/A Notes	obtained by multiplying History Compliance It No The Ref Ffort to Comply Before NOV N X (n The Res	g the Total Base F nistory enhance espondent doe OV to EDPRP/Sel	ement due to 0% es not meet th 0% ttlement Offer	Enhancement one similar NC Enhancement e culpability cri Reduction	Subt OV violation. teria.		\$0
	nefit Total EB Amounts ost of Compliance	\$525 \$500	0%	Enhancement* *Capped at the	Fotal EB \$ Amount	Subtotal 6	
SUM OF SUBTOT	ALS 1-7					Final Subtotal	\$1,050
OTHER FACTORS Reduces or enhances the Fi				only; e.g30 for -:	30%.)	Adjustment	\$0
Notes					Final Pe	nalty Amount	\$1,050
STATUTORY LIMI	T ADJUSTME	NT			Final Asse	essed Penalty	\$1,050
DEFERRAL				The second secon	Reduction	Adjustment	\$0
Reduces the Final Assessed			and the second			and a standard desired and a standard and a standar	200 - 100 -
· Notes	Deferral offer wi	tndrawn for fai	lure to settle	within the 60-d	ay time frame.		

\$1,050

PAYABLE PENALTY

Screening Date 27-Jul-2006

Docket No. 2006-1443-AIR-E

Respondent Gary Gene Crupper

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002) PCW Revision May 19, 2005

Case ID No. 30530 Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN104943642 Media [Statute] Air Quality

Enf. Coordinator Sherronda Martin

Compliance History Worksheet

Compone		Number Here	Adjust.
NOV	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current	1	5%
NOVs	enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria) Other written NOVs	0	0%
ļ	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability	1	
	(number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgment and	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
Consent Decrees	non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Conviction	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emission		0	0%
L u 7	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were	0 .	0%
Audits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%
(°	Please En Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	ter Yes or No No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
Other	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%
1	Adjustment Percen	tage (Sul	btotal 2)
epeat Violat	or (Subtotal 3)		
No	Adjustment Percen	tage (Sul	btotal 3)
ompliance I	listory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)		(FE 2.9)
Average	Adjustment Percen	tage (Sul	ototal 7)
ompliance I	History Summary		
Compliand		olation.	

C:\WINDOWS\TEMP\XPgrpwise\CrupperRsdcPCW(revised).qpw Page 3 of 4 06/11/08 Screening Date 27-Jul-2006 Docket No. 2006-1443-AIR-E Respondent Gary Gene Crupper Policy Revision 2 (September 2002) Case ID No. 30530 PCW Revision May 19, 2005 Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN104943642 Media [Statute] Air Quality Enf. Coordinator Sherronda Martin **Violation Number** 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 111.201 Primary Rule Cite(s) Tex. Health and Safety Code § 382.085(b) Secondary Rule Cite(s) Failed to comply with the prohibition of outdoor burning, as documented Violation Description during an investigation on June 14, 2006. \$10,000 **Base Penalty** Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix Harm Release Major Moderate Minor OR Actual Percent 10% Potential **Programmatic Matrix** Minor Falsification Moderate Percent Human health or the environment could be exposed to insignificant amounts of pollutants which did not exceed levels that are protective of Matrix Notes human health or environmental receptors as a result of the violation. Adjustment \$1,000 **Base Penalty Subtotal** Violation Events Number of Violation Events daily monthly Violation Base Penalty \$1,000 mark only one quarterly use a small x semiannual annual single event One single event is recommended. Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation Statutory Limit Test Violation Final Penalty Total Estimated EB Amount \$525 \$1,050

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits)

Page 4 of 4 06/11/08 C:\WINDOWS\TEMP\XPgrpwise\CrupperRsdcPCW(revised).qpw

Respondent Case ID No. Reg. Ent. Reference No.	Gary Gene Cru 30530	upper	Benefit Wo	rkshe	et		
Media [Statute] Violation No.	Air Quality		Percent Years of Interest Depreciation				
					.	5.0	15
ltem	ltem	Date	Final	Yrs	Interest	Onetime	EB
Description	Cost	Required	Date		Saved	Costs	Amount
Describitori.	No commas or \$			1 4 1 1 6			
Delayed Costs				Barry 1	a National States		Walio de la com
Equipment				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land			- 4: -	0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System	Propagation of the Control of the Co			0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling	AND DESCRIPTION OF STREET PROPERTY AND DESCRIPTION OF STREET			0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal	Management of the second			0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Notes for DELAYED costs	Savera of the second					ediana proposed in the consequence of the consequen	SMC The shall be because
Avoided Costs	ANNU	JALIZE [1] avoide	ed costs before en	tering ite	em (except for one \$0	time avoided cos	
Disposal Personnel				0.0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.0	\$0 \$0	\$0	\$0 \$0
Supplies/equipment	<u> </u>			0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0 \$0
Financial Assurance [2]			 	0.0	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.0	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Other (as needed)	\$500	14-Jun-2006	23-May-2007	1.0	\$25	\$500	\$525
Notes for AVOIDED costs	Estimated cos	t to comply wi	ith the outdoor b d. Final Date re	ourning	prohibition. Da	te Required ref	erences the
Approx. Cost of Compliance	\$500				i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i	TOTAL	\$525

Compliance History

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator:	CN603025339	CRUPPER, GARY GENE		Classification: AVERAGE	Rating: 3.00
Regulated Entity:	RN104943642	CRUPPER RESIDENCE		Classification: AVERAGE	Site Rating: 3.00
					•
D Number(s): _ocation:	4505 CATTLEGU	JARD CT, TOLAR, TX, 76476		Rating Date: September 01 0	6 Repeat Violator: NO
TCEQ Region:	REGION 04 - DF	W METROPLEX			
Date Compliance History Prepared:	February 02, 200	7			
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History:	Enforcement			•	
Compliance Period:	February 02, 200	2 to February 02, 2007			
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Info	rmation Regarding	this Compliance History			•
Name: Sherronda Martin	Ph	one: 713-767-3680			
	Site C	ompliance History Comp	onents		
I. Has the site been in existence and/or operation			Yes		
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership	-		No		
If Yes who is the surrent surser?			N/A		•
3. If Yes, who is the current owner? 4. if Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)?		·	N/A		
- Miles alid the channel (-) in accordance accord					
5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur? Components (Multimedia) for the Site:			N/A	•	
A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgemen	ts, and consent dec	rees of the state of Texas an	d the federal or	overnment	
N/A	to, and concent doc	nood of the oldies of Foxas are	a the leaster ge	,	
IV/A					
 Any criminal convictions of the state of Texture. 	as and the federal	government.			
N/A				·	
C. Chronic excessive emissions events.					
N/A The approval dates of investigations. (CCE	Ing Inv. Track No.				
	DS IIIV. Hack. No.,	·		·	
N/A	. O. J	•			
Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDDate: 04/25/2006 (464293)					
Self Report? NO	·)	Classifi	cation: Mod	derate	
Citation: 30 TAC Chap	oter 111, SubChapt				
	pter 382, SubChap mply with general p	ter A 382.085(b) rohibition on outdoor burning.		}	
F. Environmental audits.			•		
N/A					
S. Type of environmental management system	ms (EMSs).				
N/A					
Voluntary on-site compliance assessment of	dates.				
N/A					
Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction	n program.	·			
N/A					
. Early compliance.					

N/A Sites Outside of Texas N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN ENFORCEMENT ACTION CONCERNING GARY GENE CRUPPER; RN104943642

တတတတတ

BEFORE THE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2006-1443-AIR-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its ______ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Gary Gene Crupper ("Mr. Crupper") under the authority of Tex. Water Code ch. 7 and Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 382. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, represented by the Litigation Division, and Mr. Crupper represented by Mr. Robert J. Doshier, Attorneys and Counselors at Law, appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

- 1. Mr. Crupper owns a private residence located at 4505 Cattleguard Court in Hood County, Texas (the "Site").
- 2. This Agreed Order is entered into pursuant to Tex. Water Code §§ 7.051 and 7.070. The Commission has jurisdiction of this matter pursuant to Tex. Water Code § 5.013 because it alleges violations of Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 382 and TCEQ rules.
- 3. The Commission and Mr. Crupper agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that Mr. Crupper is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
- 4. Mr. Crupper received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about July 19, 2006.
- 5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by Mr. Crupper of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
- 6. An administrative penalty in the amount of one thousand fifty dollars (\$1,050.00) is assessed

by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). Mr. Crupper has paid ninety three dollars (\$93.00) of the administrative penalty. The remaining amount of nine hundred fifty seven dollars (\$957.00) of the administrative penalty shall be payable in 11 monthly payments of eighty seven dollars (\$87.00) each. The next monthly payment shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order. The subsequent payments shall each be paid not later than 30 days following the due date of the previous payment until paid in full. If Mr. Crupper fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with the payment requirements of this Agreed Order, including the payment schedule, the Executive Director may, at his option, accelerate the maturity of the remaining installments, in which event the unpaid balance shall become immediately due and payable without demand or notice. In addition, the failure of Mr. Crupper to meet the payment schedule of this Agreed Order constitutes the failure by Mr. Crupper to timely and satisfactorily comply with all of the terms of this Agreed Order.

- 7. Any notice and procedures which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
- 8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and Mr. Crupper have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
- 9. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that Mr. Crupper has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
- 10. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
- 11. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

Mr. Crupper is alleged to have violated 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 111.201 and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.085(b) by failing to comply with the prohibition of outdoor burning as documented during an inspection conducted on June 14, 2006 by a TCEQ Fort Worth Regional Office investigator.

III. DENIALS

Mr. Gary Gene Crupper DOCKET NO. 2006-1443-AIR-E Page 3

Mr. Crupper generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDER

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that Mr. Crupper pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and Mr. Crupper's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from considering or requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "Texas Commission on Environmental Quality" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Mr. Gary Gene Crupper, Docket No. 2006-1443-AIR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. Mr. Crupper shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Immediately upon the effective date of this Agreed Order, cease all unauthorized outdoor burning at the Site as outlined in 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE Chapter 111, Subchapter B; and
 - b. Submit written certification of compliance with Ordering Provision No. 2.a. as described below. The certification shall include detailed supporting documentation including receipts, and/or other records as applicable to demonstrate compliance, be notarized by a State of Texas Notary Public and include the following certification language:
 - "I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted, and I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."
 - c. Mr. Crupper shall submit copies of documentation necessary to demonstrate compliance with these Ordering Provisions to:

Mr. Gary Gene Crupper DOCKET NO. 2006-1443-AIR-E Page 4

Order Compliance Team
Enforcement Division, MC 149A
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

and

Alyssa Taylor, Air Section Manager Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Fort Worth Regional Office 2309 Gravel Drive, Fort Worth Fort Worth, Texas 76118

- 3. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon Mr. Crupper. Mr. Crupper is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Site operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
- 4. If Mr. Crupper fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, Mr. Crupper's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. Mr. Crupper shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. Mr. Crupper shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after Mr. Crupper becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
- 5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by Mr. Crupper shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until Mr. Crupper receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
- 6. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against Mr. Crupper in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 7. This agreement may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreement may be

Mr. Gary Gene Crupper DOCKET NO. 2006-1443-AIR-E Page 5

transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes.

8. Under 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.10(b) and Tex. Gov't Code § 2001.142, the effective date of this Agreed Order is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to Mr. Crupper, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to Mr. Crupper, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

The state of the s

Mr. Gary Gene Crupper DOCKET NO. 2006-1443-AIR-E Page 6 ·

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission .

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I represent that I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity, if any, indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEO, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that my failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or my failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on my compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted by me;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's office for contempt, injunctive relief. additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency.
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions against me;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions against me; and
- TCBQ secking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Name (Pfinted or typed)

Mr. Gary Gene Crupper